

# FRIENDS OF COPYTHORNE PLAYGROUND - DEVELOPMENT OF PLAYGROUND FC

## STAGE 2 TENDER - TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL

### A: TECHNICAL TENDER

No	Criteria Reference	Creative Play	Playdale
1	Third party liability cover – provide copy of certificate - Must be dated to cover the project timetable and snagging period. Quality requirement for a 5 is that it is really clear and takes account of all our requirements	£5m to 20/12/18	£10m to 27/02/19
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
2	P.I. Cover - provide copy of certificate - Dated to cover the project timetable & snagging period	£1m to 20/12/18	£2m to 27/02/19
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
3	Other Certification - Memberships; H&S certifications etc		
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		Optional	Optional
Quality Score		N/A	N/A
4	Risk Register / Management Programme - Full risk register required to show risks and mitigations – PDF File. Quality requirement for a 5 is that a detailed Risk Register is provided which is bespoke to our project and takes account of all the factors we have requested	Generic but comprehensive - could have been made more bespoke	Separate Organisation and Risk / Safety Registers
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 4	5 / 5
5	Programme of Works - Full programme included in Gantt or similar format – PDF File. Quality requirement for a 5 is a fully comprehensive programme which is cross-referred to the risk register and takes account of all our requirements	Programme provided - can complete by 01-06-18	Full programme provided
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5

No	Criteria Reference	Creative Play	Playdale
6	Site Management and Security Plan - Full plan included as a table of issues and solutions / actions – PDF File. Quality requirement for a 5 is a thorough plan which takes account of all our requirements especially those in relation to site safety and the issues of access times	Comprehensive and security fencing now satisfactory	Method statement included but what about site security?
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 4
7	Full Details of team members actively involved on site in project including main contact name and details - List in PDF File. Must be comprehensive	Only for main team - can provide sub cons if awarded contract and their own arrangements secured	Only for main team - can provide sub cons if awarded contract and their own arrangements secured
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
8	DESIGN		
8a	Design 1 – All requested Plans included in hard copy submission in A3 format: Plan View + Dimensions; Elevation View Side 1 + Dimensions; Elevation View Side 2 + Dimensions; Elevation View Side 3 with Dimensions; Elevation Side View 4 + Dimensions; Design/Artists Impression View(s)	All clear and comprehensive	Dimensions not clear and overall design not all that was briefed
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score			
8b	Design Characteristics – Play Value - Narrative of no more than 400 words on the play value offered by specific design layout. Quality score for a 5 is a thorough and well-structured rationale with good reasoning for the offered design	Well described	Provided
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		4 / 5 / 5	3 / 5 / 5
8c	Design Characteristics – Inspiration - Narrative of no more than 500 words on the inspiration value of the design. Quality score for a 5 is a thorough and well-structured rationale with good reasoning for the offered design which demonstrates the benefits and added value	Well described	Provided
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		4 / 5 / 4	4 / 5 / 5

No	Criteria Reference	Creative Play	Playdale
8d	Design Characteristics – Alignment with Brief supplied by FOCP - Does the design incorporate the full features required by the Brief – (if any deviation from the Brief, please supply a narrative of no more than 300 words to explain rationale) Quality score for a 5 is – 1 only minimally met with several differences to 5 which is fully met OR met with some well-argued changes and alternatives	Only metal shoes on towers - others fixed direct to ground	Failed to include deviations from spec-fence, springer, playspace underneath
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	F
Quality Score		4 / 5 / 5	1 / 3 / 2
8e	Design Characteristics - Sustainability - Narrative of no more than 300 words on the Sustainability of the design – longevity of materials and installation. Quality score of a 5 is that the offered solutions in terms of life-cycle meet our requirements as set out in the tender including the guarantees where required	Do we need info on drying of the wood? / Well described	% not figures, not specific to equipment
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	F
Quality Score		4 / 5 / 5	1 / 2 / 2
8f	Design Characteristics – Ground Works - Narrative of no more than 200 words on the appropriateness of the ground works and cover. Quality score for a 5 is that the offered solution is a strong, safe and well-built base which has adequate foundations, covers the entire area and meets the life-cycle requirements	Best ground works and safety surface	? Rubber mulch on to solid ground/ membrane- not a base layer - guranteed for 5 years but groundworks only 1 year
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	F
Quality Score		5 / 5 / 5	1 / 3 / 2

## DESIGN CHECKLIST FOR REQUIREMENTS

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	Creative Play	Playdale
1	Multiplay unit – 3 Tower	Y - (but feel they could better us 3rd tower)	Y
2	1 X Tower suitable for toddlers or smaller children - Requires and easy route up and a slide down - Slides NOT south facing	Y	Y
3	1 x Tower of at least 1.8 metres suitable for up to 12 year olds - A challenging route up and a bigger slide down - Slides NOT south facing	Y	Y
4	Fireman's Pole	Y	Y
5	Play space beneath the unit - Utilise this as additional play space with exploration route such as a tunnel and complete with playboards / playhouse and seating	Y	N
6	Monkey Bars - Fitted within the design in a suitable location	Y	N
7	Swings – 1 x Cradle; 1 x Flat; 1 x Basket - Please specify height of swings	Y	Y
8	Benches – 2 x benches - In metal or a suitable other water repellent surface	Y - (but feel they could better use 3rd tower / wooden benches)	Y
9	Spring – See Saw - For at least two people and not a rocker type	N - (though could change 2 <sup>nd</sup> tramp)	N
10	Balance – balance elements to be included - Ideally a trim trail	Y	Y - Though poor
11	Roundabout - Preference for a roundabout if space permits rather than a spinning pole or dish	Y	Y
12	Trampoline - Large enough for 2 children – constructed with adequate drainage	Y - ?need for 2	N - (1 x small)
13	Path - Extend current path to lead to 1 x metal gate and metal fencing	Y	N - wood fence
14	Structural elements – our preference is now for timber wherever possible - All timber structural components to be based on metal footings, and not concreted into ground, thereby held clear of ground to prevent rotting	N - Tower only - unable to do ALL	N - Tower only

**B: COMMERCIAL TENDER**

ITEM	NARRATIVE	Creative Play	Playdale
1	PRICE 1 - The maximum budget for the full project is £50,000. All Tenders must acknowledge this price as a final upper limit with no additional costs for the works of their completion.	£49,995.00	£49,997.34
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
2	PRICE 2 - This is a fixed price and the contract will reflect this.	Acknowledged fixed price	Acknowledged
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
3	PRICE 3 - The only circumstances in which any price variation will be accepted are in respect of unforeseen ground conditions requiring additional works. Any change to that effect will be the subject of written application to the client and will require verification by the client surveyor before any agreement to additional expenditure. The contractor carries all equipment supply and installation costs risks		Accepted
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
4	PRICE 4 - All necessary license and technical sign off documents required for practical completion and handover are costed within the fixed price and are not additional to the quoted figure		
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		5 / 5	5 / 5
5	PRICE 5 - We expect that Friends of Copythorne Playground Limited will be VAT exempt. Therefore, we would ask that you indicate your acknowledgement of this in your response and your willingness to invoice accordingly	Price is ex Vat	Price is ex VAT
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		N/A	N/A

ITEM	NARRATIVE	Creative Play	Playdale
6	WARRANTIES - We would expect warranties to be a minimum of 5 years for fittings and a minimum of 20 years for structural components – NOTE: any variations to this should be noted for discussion and may be used in any negotiation should we decide to award	All guraanteed 5 / 20 years except for trampolines - 2 years	Structure 20 years Surface 5 years Ropes and bridges 3 years Chains swing seats bearings and scramble net 2 years Groundwork only 1 year!
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		3	2
7	TERMS AND CONFITIONS 1 - A bespoke narrative from FOCP is provided on Terms and Conditions as submitted by you in the Stage 1 Submission and it is expected that you will acknowledge these requirements in your Tender – NOTE: where they have contested back to us on any of pour observations, these should be noted and may form part of a negotiation should we decide to award	All our required changes accepted EXCEPT SGA exclusions - subjet to negotiations	Have accepted our T&C amendments Asking for 30% deposit, 20% equipment delivery, 40% completion, 10% retention
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		P	P
Quality Score		3	4
8a	TERMS AND CONDITIONS 2 - The contract and warranties must be assignable post completion as the ownership of the playground transfers to Copythorne Parish Council on completion	Transferable warranties not mentioned	Clarification would be required as not specified
Pass (P) / Fail (F)		F	F
Quality Score		0	0

<b>SUMMARY OF ALL SCORES</b>			
		Creative Play	Playdale
1	Third Party Cover - PF - Max Score 10	10	10
2	PI Cover- Max Score 10	10	10
3	Other Certification - N/A		
4	Risk Register - Max Score 10	9	10
5	Programme of Works - Max Score 10	10	10
6	Site Management & Security Plan - Max Score 10	10	9
6A	Team Members - Max Score 10	10	10
7	Design - Plans		
8	Design 1 - Play Value - Max Score 15	14	13
9	Design 2 - Inspiration - Max Score 15	13	14
11	Design 3 - Alignment to Brief - 15	14	6
12	Design 4 - Sustainability - Max Score 15	14	5
13	Design 5 - Ground Works - Max Score 15	15	6
14	Price 1 - Max Budget - Max Score 10	10	10
15	Price 2 - Fixed Price - Max Score 10	10	10
16	Price 3 - Price Variation - Max Score 10	10	10
17	Price 4 - Licences and Other Costs Included - Max Score 10	10	10
	Price 5 - VAT - No score		
18	Warranties - Max Score 5	3	2
19	Terms and Conditions 1 - Max Score 5	3	4
20	Terms and Conditions 2 - Max Score 5	0	0
	<b>TOTAL SCORE - OUT OF 190</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>149</b>
	<b>No. of FAIL in main scoring schedule</b> <i>(does not include those marked 'N' in design brief review)</i>	<b>0</b>	<b>4</b>
	<b>Proposed Decision</b>	<b>AWARD</b>	<b>REJECT</b>

**NOTES**

- 1, There are still some areas of negotiation needed with Creative Play if we decide to proceed and award
2. One of the key areas we now need to focus on is the issue of VAT and a need to award